

Short-Term Mission on

Activity 3.3 “Improve Veterinary Inspection Organisation”
- Food Safety -
- Workshop 1/3 –

Mission report

1. Names of experts

1. Fr. Dr. Sigrid Brendgen, Amt für Verbraucherschutz, Stadt Düsseldorf, Germany
2. Dr. Karljosef Graf, LAVES Zentrale Oldenburg, Germany

2. Objective and task of the mission:

The objective of the activity is to elaborate proposals for a suitable organisation of the veterinary inspections and to develop a guideline compendium including checklistst for inspection.

Date of visit: **10.12. - 13.12.2007**

3. Identification and description of activities during the visit

Introduction

International/world wide trade with food has a tendency for globalisation. All foodstuffs are available around the year world wide.

This trade attitude has a high potential for internationalisation of pathogens and a risk of spread for residues and contaminants.

Many international organisations like OIE, WHO, FAO, Codex Alimentarius work on security of global trade in animal products together with surveillance and control of food safety. Harmonisation of health standards for international trade concerning products can be found in the International Animal Health Code of the OIE to assist the development of health regulations in Member states.

The EU follows their principle „Safe food from healthy animals“. This principle includes measures on the whole food chain, beginning at the animal health status, including slaughter, processing and retail.

It can be summarised that Global trade increases tremendously and food safety aspects are of high concern (FAO, WHO, OIE). Regulations regarding the global trade and food safety aspects are implemented by WTO, Codex Alimentarius Commission, OIE.

One tool to achieve and after implementation maintain food safety is to establish a “prerequisite food hygiene program” by the food business operator and its check by a food inspection service. Another modern tool is to establish and implement a HACCP system. That is also a task of a food business operator. It must be checked by a food inspection service, too.

- a) **Participants:** see lists of participants
- b) **Monday, 10.12.2007**

10th of December 2007 (Monday)

VENUES:

10h00	<i>Veterinary Faculty Zmaja od Bosne 90 Department for animal health economics Sarajevo</i>	Opening of the working session Speaker: Mr. Slaviša Krestalića State Veterinary Office in BiH
10h15		General principles of Food Hygiene – Code of practice - Speaker: Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf
11h30		<i>Coffee break</i>
11h45		General principles of Food Hygiene – Code of practice - Speaker: Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf
13h00		<i>Lunch break</i>
13h45		Food establishment inspection planning Speaker: Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf
15h00		<i>Coffee break</i>
15h15		Food establishment inspection execution Speaker: Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf
16h30		END OF DAY ONE

Tuesday, 11.12.2007

11th of December 2007 (Tuesday)

VENUES:

10h00	<i>Veterinary Faculty Zmaja od Bosne 90 Department for animal health economics Sarajevo</i>	History and status of the HACCP system Speaker: Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES
11h30		<i>Coffee break</i>
11h45		Importance and advantages of the HACCP system Speaker: Mr. Karljosef Graf

	LAVES
13h00	<i>Lunch break</i>
13h45	The essentials of the HACCP system and how to use it Speaker: Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES
15h00	<i>Coffee break</i>
15h15	How to control a HACCP system Speaker: Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES
16h30	END OF DAY TWO

Wednesday, 12.12.2007

12th of December 2007 (Wednesday)

VENUES:

10h00	<i>Veterinary Faculty Zmaja od Bosne 90 Department for animal health economics Sarajevo</i>	<p>HACCP-questionnaire: 10 questions to HACCP system Answering of the questions by the participants</p> <p>Speaker: Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES</p> <p>Elaboration of proposals on a suitable organisation for the veterinary inspections and development of a guideline compendium</p> <p>Output:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of a guideline compendium incl. checklists - Strategy paper describing further steps to be taken for implementation of e.g. monitoring programs and a draft time schedule - Written proposal on the official adaptation of the recommendations resulting from assessment <p>Speaker: Ms. Slobodanka Cekić State Veterinary Office in BiH Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES</p> <p>Participants: see lists of participants</p>
13h00		<i>Lunch break</i>
13h45		Elaboration of proposals on a suitable organisation for the veterinary inspections and development of a

16h00	<p>guideline compendium</p> <p>Output:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> - Development of a guideline compendium incl. checklists - Strategy paper describing further steps to be taken for implementation of e.g. monitoring programs and a draft time schedule - Written proposal on the official adaptation of the recommendations resulting from assessment <p>Speaker: Ms. Slobodanka Cekić State Veterinary Office in BiH Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES</p> <p>Participants: see lists of participants</p> <p>END OF DAY THREE</p>
-------	--

Thursday, 13.12.2007

13th of December 2007 (Thursday)

VENUES:

10h00	<p><i>Istočno Sarajevo</i> <i>Milana Tepića 104</i></p>	<p>Visit to the abattoir „PAJIĆ PROM“ d.o.o. Istočno Sarajevo</p>
12h00		<p>Discussion about findings Evaluation of the findings Recommendations and conclusions</p> <p>Speaker: Ms. Sigrid Brendgen Local Veterinary Unit of the City Düsseldorf Mr. Karljosef Graf LAVES</p>
14h00		<p>END OF DAY FOUR</p>

4. Summary of the results of the mission

General conclusions/recommendations:

The workshop was well planned, however time allocation was not enough especially for group working. All necessary information belonging to the conduction of a thorough inspection (prerequisite program and HACCP system) according to the EU-legislation has been provided by the experts. The code of practice provides a good basic form for the participants to intensify their knowledge. The learning effects were verified by a HACCP

questionnaire. The course started to develop a checklist for food inspection of establishments as a nationwide standard (draft). During an inspection of a slaughterhouse the participants should apply the presented inspection system. The discussion of the findings showed that the inspectors are principally aware of the deficiencies. Difficulties occurred where enforcement activities seems to be necessary.

Legal basis

Legal base for the whole food chain in equivalence to the EU-legislation is not complete. There are gaps according to the regulations (EU) nrs. 178/2002, 852/2004 and 882/2004. According to the regulations food business companies need to establish and implement a HACCP system until January, 15 th, 2008. Starting from this date the food Inspection service has to control these systems. Therefore knowledge about the prerequisite programs and the HACCP system is necessary.

The veterinary inspectors seem to have not fully awareness of the requirements belonging to the basis of inspection strategy and the HACCP system, which is necessary when an inspector shall check the own controls, the HAACP plan and the HACCP records of a food business operation in the future. Generally the participants are not conscious about the demands that has to be fulfilled by the veterinary authorities according to the EU-Regulation nr. 882/2004 (lack of inspection form, lack of files – therefore no documentation of official activities).

It seems that the existing law is not known by every participant.

Recommendations concerning the legal basis:

The whole Food Safety and Inspection Service must be better informed and trained in regulatory requirements. Better exchange of information between the different authority levels is necessary. One central organisation should be responsible for legislation in veterinary matters and food safety.

Self-responsibility/self-control systems:

There are no rules laid down in the food hygiene law of BiH dealing with the self-responsibility of the food business operators according to those of the regulation (EC) 178/2002.

The self-control systems are not as systematic as they should be. The existing plans are not detailed and implemented exactly. There is a lack of documentation.

Recommendations concerning self-responsibility/self-control systems:

Food business operators are primary self responsible for the safety of their operations and products. Corresponding rules must be defined by law.

Food business operators must develop detailed plans for various areas of their self-control system. They have to follow those plans exactly and document their operations accurately.

Enforcement activities:

Legal rules for enforcement are laid down in the regulations. The deficiencies listed below indicated that they are not implemented in the field.

Recomendation

Establish standardized inspection system. Enforce enforcement activities.

To-do-list

- a) The checklist, which was prepared in the work-shop as a draft, must be completed.
- b) The applicability of the checklist for the regularly inspection should be proofed.
We suggest that the draft checklist should be evaluated in a follow-up-workshop (e.g. after three months of application). In this workshop should be decided whether there is something to add or to remove.
- c) The whole Food Inspection Service (at all levels) is to be informed about the Federal Decision of general hygiene requirements for all foodstuff establishments.
- d) Valuable aspects of the mentioned Decision are to be incorporated into the checklist.
- e) The findings in the slaughterhouse should be assessed by each participant of the workshop in regard to the potential risk and later be discussed in the above mentioned later workshop (see c)).
- f) Development of a HACCP training program for inspectors.
- g) A comparison between the EU-inspection system explained in the presentation and the actual performed inspection system of BiH should be prepared step by step. Deviations should be corrected/filled.
- h) The actual used documentation system of the BiH-Food Inspection service should be compared with the EU-requirements (Regulation Nr. 882/2004). Eventually gaps should be filled.

General remarks for the slaughterhouse (incl. meat processing department)

Introduction

The plant has an old part. A new part was built in 2001. It was visited in operation (slaughtering of a bull, cutting, production of sausages). No paper work was looked at.

The following deficiencies were noticed:

- missing of a hygienic room/area at the entrance to the production rooms

- missing hand washbasins, liquid soap, single use paper towels and baskets in production and cutting area
- no sterilisation basins for knives in the cutting room
- lack in house-keeping (damage of the floor and of tiles; corrosion); no plan for systematic house-keeping
- several missing lighting shieldings (e.g. packaging room)
- in the smoking room for traditional smoking is an open fire; the used wood is not standardised
- missing personal hygienic lockers
- packing material in the cutting room
- generally good cleaning but partially deficiencies in cleaning (e.g. hoses, electric equipment, smoking vehicles and smoking sticks)
- using of inappropriate materials (e.g. wooden material of a stick)
- worn out utensils (e.g. brushes)
- in the cooling room for smoked products the products are tied (with ropes); it is better to hang them up on metal hooks; the products have contact with the surface of the equipment
- seats with velvet covers (cannot be cleaned and disinfected)
- dead and alive flies in the rooms and in lighting shieldings, no UV-fly traps
- in some rooms high humidity/condensation (mould spots)
- wrong hygienic behaviour of employees (e.g. utensils lying on working areas, knives were

- not cleaned and disinfected in between), need for hygienic education
- no complete hygienic clothing in some cases for employees (e.g. black boots);
- no removing of watches and jewelleryes

----- (Signature)
17.12.2007, Dr. Sigrid Brendgen

----- (Signature)
17.12.2007, Dr. Karljosef Graf